#### VIRGINIA FAIR HOUSING BOARD

#### MINUTES OF MEETING

February 15, 2012

The Fair Housing Board Meeting was held at the Department of Professional and Occupational Regulation, 9960 Mayland Drive, Richmond, Virginia. The following Board members were present:

> Phyllis Randall, Chair F. Thomas Eck, IV, Vice-Chair Matthew K. Kim Rosemary Wilson Thomas Gifford **Bob Boynton** Linda Broady-Myers Andrew Reisinger Jim Ginnell Francis Stevens

The following Board members were absent:

David Rubinstein Jeffrey Adkins

DPOR Staff present for all or part of the meeting included:

Gordon Dixon, Director Christine Martine, Executive Director Liz Hayes, Fair Housing Administrator Deanda Shelton, Assistant Fair Housing Administrator Jeffrey Williams, Board Administrator Emily Trent, Administrative Assistant Angela Keefe-Thomas, Fair Housing Investigator Matt Vincent, Fair Housing Investigator Trudy Miller, Fair Housing Investigator

Tom Payne, Assistant Attorney General with the Office of the Attorney General, was present.

Chair Randall called the meeting to order at 10:02 A.M. Call to Order

A motion was made by Mr. Kim and seconded by Ms. Agenda Broady-Myers to approve the Agenda. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers,

Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Kim to approve the December 8, 2011, Fair Housing Board The motion passed unanimously. Meeting minutes. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

Minutes

There was no public comment.

Liz Hayes updated the Board on the current investigative case load.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-04837, John O'Brien v. Leisureville Unit Owners Association Board of Directors, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. Steven Lauer, attorney for the respondent, was present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-04983, Gloria Glover v. Hopewell Redevelopment and Housing Authority, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. Gloria Glover, complainant, Yolanda Stokes, Power of Attorney, for the complainant, were present and addressed the Board. A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Ms. Wilson to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Feranti, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Shanel Corporation, and Analysis and Recommendation, and Official Consultation Vince Feranti

**Public Comment** 

Fair Housing Administrator's Report

FHB File Number 2011-04837, John O'Brien v. Leisureville Unit Owners Association Board of Directors

FHB File Number 2011-04983, Gloria Glover v. Hopewell Redevelopment and Housing Authority

FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC,

Memorandum from the Office of the Attorney General as supplemental memoranda. Terra complainant, Neil Kuchinsky, attorney for the respondents, and Vince Feranti, respondent, were present and addressed the Board

At 10:57 A.M., Ms. Randall offered a motion which was Closed Session seconded by Mr. Gifford, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne, Liz Hayes, Angela Keefe-Thomas and Deanda Shelton.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

#### 11. FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Feranti

At 11:49 A.M., a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Mr. Gifford that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by

the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 10-0

AYES: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell,

Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Adkins and

Rubinstein.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Feranti, a motion was made by Ms. Wilson and seconded by Ms. Broady-Myers to defer the case until staff does further investigation on whether the respondent's policy is a pre-text to discrimination against families with children. The motion passed by majority vote. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Stevens and Wilson. Members voting "No" were: Eck, Gifford and Reisinger.

FHB File Number 2010-01881, Terra Bacon v. Terrace Properties, LLC, Shanel Corporation, and Vince Feranti

The Board recessed from 11:55 A.M. to 12:05 P.M.

Break

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-03468, William J. Deshazo v. Gonzalee Ford, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Kim to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2011-03468, William J. Deshazo v. Gonzalee Ford

In the matter of FHB File Number 2011-04812, Sara Antes v. Investors USA III, LLC, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Ms. Broady-Myers to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim,

FHB File Number 2011-04812, Sara Antes v. Investors USA III, LLC

Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-00589, Mohamed Saad v. Bank of America, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Kim and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2012-00589, Mohamed Saad v. Bank of America

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-00753, Patricia Castellano v. Jacqueline Tran, the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis and Recommendation. A motion was made by Mr. Gifford and seconded by Mr. Kim to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2012-00753, Patricia Castellano v. Jacqueline Tran

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-00177, James Summers v. Curtis Coulthard and Curtis C. Coulthard & June Johnston co-trustees Coulthard Family Trust. the Board reviewed the record which consisted of the Final Investigative Report and Case Analysis Recommendation. A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Ms. Broady-Myers to close the case with a finding of no reasonable cause. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2012-00177, James Summers v. Curtis Coulthard and Curtis C. Coulthard & June Johnston co-trustees **Coulthard Family Trust** 

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-00990, Beulah Arrington v. Newport News Redevelopment and Housing Authority and Lisa Burden, a motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Kim to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2012-00990, Beulah Arrington v. Newport News Redevelopment and Housing Authority and Lisa Burden

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-00362, Jody Nescola v, Frances Beatty and 506 South Braddock 00362, Jody Nescola v.

FHB File Number 2012-

Street, LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Kim to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed LLC unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck. Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

Frances Beatty and 506 South Braddock Street,

In the matter of FHB File Number 2012-01427, Tiffany Sparks v. Marion "Betsy" Kimmelshue, Ann Hodgins Lehman, and The Hodgins, LLC, a motion was made by Mr. Eck and seconded by Mr. Kim to approve the terms of the conciliation agreement as agreed to by the parties. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2012-01427, Tiffany Sparks v. Marion "Betsy" Kimmelshue, Ann Hodgins Lehman, and The Hodgins, LLC

In the matter of FHB File Number 2009-03646, Robert Ann Lebrun v. Cedarwood Condominium Association, Inc., a motion was made by Ms. Boynton and seconded by Ms. Broady-Myers to approve the terms of the settlement as presented. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

FHB File Number 2009-03646, Robert and Ann Lebrun v. Cedarwood Condominium Association, Inc.

A motion was made by Ms. Broady-Myers and seconded by Mr. Ginnell to approve the proposed response to the public comment for the Periodic and Small Business Review. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

**Administrative Issues** 

A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Ms. Wilson to retain the Board's Public Participation Guidelines, and Fair Housing Certification Regulations as The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

Tom Payne gave the Board an update on pending litigation. No action was taken by the Board.

Old Business

At 12:37 P.M., Ms. Randall offered a motion which was Closed Session seconded by Mr. Boynton, that the Board meeting be recessed and that the Fair Housing Board immediately

reconvene in closed meeting for the purpose of consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members pertaining to actual or probable litigation as permitted by §2.2-3711.A.7 of the Code of Virginia. The following nonmembers will be in attendance to reasonably aid the consideration of the topic: Tom Payne and Liz Hayes.

This motion is made with respect to the matter(s) identified as agenda item(s):

#### Old Business - Litigation Report

At 12:55 P.M., a motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Ms. Broady-Myers that the Board reconvene in open session.

WHEREAS, the Fair Housing Board has convened a closed Certification meeting on this date pursuant to an affirmative recorded vote in accordance with the provisions of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act; and

WHEREAS, §2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia requires a certification by this Fair Housing Board that such closed meeting was conducted in conformity with Virginia law;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Fair Housing Board hereby certifies that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements by Virginia law were discussed in the closed meeting to which this certification resolution applies and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion convening the closed meeting were heard, discussed or considered by the Fair Housing Board.

VOTE: 10-0

AYES: Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

NAYS: None.

ABSENT DURING THE VOTE: None.

ABSENT DURING THE MEETING: Adkins and

Rubinstein.

A motion was made by Ms. Randall and seconded by Ms. Old Business Wilson to allow the Board counsel to proceed with litigation as advised. The motion passed unanimously. Members voting "Yes" were Broady-Myers, Boynton, Eck, Gifford, Ginnell, Kim, Randall, Reisinger, Stevens and Wilson.

The Board adjourned at 12:59 P.M.

Gordon Dixon, Secretary

1.	Name: Rosemary Wilson
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature 2/15/12 Date

1.	Name: Phyllis Randall
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
,	Thy 15 R groball Signature  Feb 15, 2012 Date

1.	Name: Francis Stevens
2.	(Name of Board Member)  Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	데 I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Zlibliz Date

1.	Name: Matthew K. Kim
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	<ul> <li>□ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.</li> <li>or</li> </ul>
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
3.,	
	Signature Date

1.	Name: Bob Boynton
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	provide
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	N/A
	I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature 2/15/2012  Date

1.	Name: Thomas C. Gifford (Name of Board Member)
2.	Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012  (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
/	Dud Alby 2/15/12
	Signature Date/

(Name of Board Member)  Title: Board Member
Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
(Agenda Item)
Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.

1.	Name: F. Thomas Eck, IV
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	□ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.\ /	I do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
/	Signature 2/15/202

1.	Name: Jim Ginnell
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title:Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature 2/15/12.

1.	Name:Linda Broady-Myers
2.	(Name of Board Member) Title: Board Member
3.	Agency: Fair Housing Board (Name of Board)
4.	Meeting/IFF Date: February 15, 2012 (Date)
5.	I have a personal interest in the following transaction:
	(Agenda Item)
	Nature of Personal Interest Affected by Transaction:
	I declare that I am a member of the following business, profession, occupation or group, the members of which are affected by the transaction:
	☐ I am able to participate in this transaction fairly, objectively, and in the public interest.  or
	☐ I did not participate in the transaction.
6.	do not have a personal interest in any transactions taken at this meeting.
	Signature Date Date